

**3<sup>rd</sup> Recommended List  
Project Board Meeting (RLP03)**

**at 11.00 on Tuesday 19<sup>th</sup> April 2011**

**at The Farmers Club, London**

**Minutes**

**Present:**

Prof Graham Jellis (Chairman)  
Dr Susannah Bolton (HGCA)  
Dr David Cranstoun (HGCA)  
Mr David Houghton (Barley, Oats & Other Cereals Chair)  
Dr Thomas Jolliffe (BSPB)  
Dr Penny Maplestone (BSPB)  
Mr Nigel Moore (BSPB)  
Mrs Heather Peck (Wheat Chair)  
Mr Gary Sharkey (nabim)  
Mr Paul Taylor (AIC)  
Mr Andrew Ward (Oilseeds Chair)

**In Attendance:**

Dr Jim McVittie (RL Lead Manager)  
Mr Simon Oxley (Observer)  
Mr Bill Handley (RL Technical Manager)  
Mrs Joanne Soule (RL Database Executive)

**03/01 Attendance & apologies for absence**

The Chairman welcomed everybody to the meeting particularly Mr Andrew Ward and Dr Simon Oxley who were attending for the first time. He also gave thanks to those involved with getting the consortium agreement signed on time and recognised the amount of work put into this.

Apologies had been received from Mr Bob King. Mr Guy Smith was absent.

**03/02 Minutes from the previous meeting**

a) Confidential version

Mr Smith was added to the attendees list of the last meeting as he had been omitted. With that change, the minutes were signed as correct.

b) Non-confidential version

With the change as above, the minutes were signed as correct.

Mr Moore commented that he would like to see what has been deleted between the confidential and non confidential versions. It was agreed that “track changes” to be used for future copies.

### **03/03 Matters arising not covered elsewhere**

Dr McVittie advised a revised start date for Dr Oxley of 18 May.

### **03/04 RL Project Managers report**

Dr McVittie reported that the current focus of the team was the preparation of labels and bags for the grain sample tests. Mr Handley will soon be starting trial inspections with one winter oilseed rape site in Fife to be revisited during flowering. It was hoped that the site would produce useful data for the RL but it was not looking good for NL. However, Mr Handley advised that Adam Christie had called and to say that he was now more optimistic about the site.

### **03/05 Progress of trial tender**

The RL team are currently evaluating all bids received but due to the constraints of the procurement process Mr Handley was unable to update on a likely outcome. However, the bids received were of a high standard. The review process was due to finish in the next few weeks with contractors and the Project Board being advised of awards accordingly.

Pathology, quality, seed handling, disease tests and milling and malting were not put out to tender this year and the RL team are looking for a one year extension to the current contracts. This will allow Dr Oxley to settle into his new role before immersing himself in a tender process. The Chairman asked if the Board would be happy with the one year extension to non trials. Mr Moore questioned whether the Board should be awarding the contracts but the Chairman advised that at the last meeting the Board decided it was an HGCA responsibility. The Project Board was in agreement for a one year extension.

Trial Review Process:

This involves producing individual sheets, one per package, showing points awarded for each submitted bid. Decisions are 30% on price and 70% on technical competence, suitability of the site proposed etc.

Dr Bolton commented that the team have to meet public procurement rules and once final packages are selected there is a period of reflection. A letter will be sent to each contractor advising them whether they have been successful in their bid(s), advising those not awarded the scores of their bid and also those of the winning bid. They then have 10 days to appeal the award. She commented that the rigours of the process and the complexity of the packages have resulted in a lot of additional work, over and above the initial expectations of the RL team.

Guidance would be sought from AHDB Procurement in regard to the Project Boards' involvement in the final stages of the process as there were possible conflicts of interests as some members of the Board have applied for work.

Dr Joliffe queried the availability of trial protocols but it was noted that as part of the tender process all protocols had been made public. Copies would be added to the extranet so the Board could see them **Action Mr Handley.**

### **03/06 Consortium agreement**

Dr Bolton added to those sentiments expressed by the Chairman at the beginning of the meeting, by also expressing her thanks and gratitude to all parties involved with signing the

agreement. Dr Bolton felt the agreement gives a sound basis for the continuation of the project and represented a genuine step towards the new partnership.

The process for candidate selection was raised and it was clarified that the drafting of selection criteria was delegated to the Crop Committees and *proposals* brought to the Board. The decisions were the responsibility of the Project Board and this was the case for all Crop Committee business. The Chairman asked that the Crop Committee chairs explain this to their committees. The Board considered that the only likely reason to reject a Crop Committee proposal would be that the committee failed to follow the agreed procedures and selection criteria. In such a case, the breeders would need to be aware of the situation before the appeals meeting.

The Board would discuss the candidate selection procedures at the June meeting.

### **03/07 Approval of budget**

Dr McVittie reported that the RL budget was in the consortium agreement. Once trial tenders had been agreed a more detailed breakdown would be available. The Board requested this for the June meeting. **Action Dr Oxley.**

### **03/08 Composition of Crop Committees**

A list of proposed members for the crop committees was reviewed and a revised version is attached to the minutes (Appendix 1). The following points were noted:

#### Oilseed Rape Crop Committee

It was suggested that it would be appropriate for Dr Gladders to serve until 2014. This would be confirmed at the end of 2011 when his current term expires.

#### Wheat Crop Committee

Mrs Peck will shortly be interviewing for the HGCA Grower vacancy.

It was agreed that Mr Manfield's term would expire in 2012, with the soon-to-be appointed member expiring in 2013.

Mr Brosnan is to be appointed to 2013.

#### Barley, Oats & Other Cereals Crop Committee

In the absence of Mr King, it was not possible to confirm the MAGB appointee nor the MAGB observer. The Board would be advised of developments as soon as possible. It was noted that Dr Brosnan was not the MAGB observer but rather an additional observer who would normally be invited to the planning meeting when micro-malting test results were discussed.

It was confirmed that the appointment of Mr Cairns would be until 2013.

### **03/09 Discussions**

#### **Progress of RL crop committee handbooks**

Dr Maplestone had drafted a paper and presented it to the Board for review. The Board approved the format but it was agreed that more work was required on this before it could be reviewed in detail. Dr Cranstoun had a few comments which he would pass onto Dr Oxley.

**Action Dr Cranstoun.**

As an interim measure, it was agreed that the Crop Committees would largely work on the old procedures for their planning meetings as no major changes were envisaged.

It was thought important that the Board should review all procedures before they were used at decision meetings. Dr Oxley was asked to develop Dr Maplestone's handbook in time for the June meeting. **Action Dr Oxley.**

### **Use of HGCA RL data and tables by third parties**

The Board could see advantages in the continued widespread use of RL tables and data but thought there should be a tighter control than in the past.

It was noted that the consortium agreement allowed HGCA to claim copyright on the RL tables and to sub-licence them. It was agreed that Dr Oxley would prepare a draft licence and circulate this to the Board for comment. **Action Dr Oxley.**

### **RL at Cereals 2011**

Dr Bolton presented a copy of a paper from Anna Farrell with a proposal of making the RL a feature at this years event. This suggestion follows comments received via a Strategy & KT survey held at last years event whereby those surveyed suggested more value could be added to the RL.

It is suggested that a voting plinth and questionnaire be used again at Cereals to capture invaluable industry input, which could then be used to produce an RL document that the industry wants to see.

The general view is that growers do not know how to use the RL to its full advantage and that part of this interactive voting process would show growers how best to use the RL.

### **Minimum standards**

The Chairman advised that this was an issue that had been raised a number of times and asked the Board to consider if they wanted to review minimum standards, how to set them and if they wanted to be more specific about different diseases.

Dr McVittie added that approval is required on whether or not to round minimum standards for committee use; they would continue to be displayed as a whole number in publications. Mr Moore stated that robust and consistent data is what is required. Discussions around this point and minimum standard fluctuations took place with the overall conclusion that the use of minimum standards is appropriate and that rounding should not take place at the committee stage; i.e. if the standard was 3.0, a variety with a rating of 2.5-2.9 would not be acceptable. Minimum standards are in place to protect the grower and not to influence the breeder, for example by insisting on ever increasing disease resistance through higher ratings.

However, the Chairman asked for crop committees to look at the minimum standards they have set and ensure they appropriate for the market, with this information to be reviewed by the Board at its next meeting. Ms Lawson was asked to place this on the agenda.

**Action Ms Lawson.**

### **03/10 AOB**

Mr Houghton and Mr Moore advised that they will be unable to attend the next meeting and queried if there is a requirement for deputy attendance. It was confirmed that parties to the consortium (i.e. Mr Moore) could send a deputy but not Crop Committee Chairs. It was noted that Prof Jellis and Dr Bolton were attending the barley planning meeting so could report back to the Board.

The meeting closed at 14:50

Signed..... Date.....

### HGCA Recommended List

#### Crop Committee membership – April 2011

##### RL Oilseeds Crop Committee

<b>Member</b>	<b>Position</b>	<b>Membership date</b>	<b>Notes</b>
Jo Bowman	BSPB appointee	Term expires December 2011	
Matthew Clarke	BSPB appointee	Term expires December 2012	
Peter Gladders	Pathologist	Term expires December 2011	The Board agreed that it might be appropriate for Peter to serve until 2014 but this would be confirmed at the end of 2011
Jamie Mackay	Agronomist	Term expires December 2011	
Andrew Gilchrist	Variety Specialist	Term expires December 2013	
Philip Marr	Agronomist	Term expires December 2012	
David Colville	Grower (Scotland)	Term expires December 2012	
Andrew Shirvell	Grower	Term expires December 2011	HGCA Appointee
Andrew Cragg	Farmer Board member of United Oilseeds	Term expires December 2013	HGCA appointee
John Thorpe	Trader	Term expires December 2013	

**RL Wheat Crop Committee**

<b>Member</b>	<b>Position</b>	<b>Membership date</b>	<b>Notes</b>
Richard Summers	BSPB appointee	Term expires December 2011	
Robert Hiles	BSPB appointee	Term expires December 2012	
James Brown	Pathologist	Term expires December 2012	
Mark Charlton	Nabim appointee	Current term expires December 2012	
James Brosnan	Distiller	Term, expires December 2011	
Keith Norman	Agronomist	Term, expires December 2012	
Mark Rogerson	Trader	Term expires December 2011	
Andrew Stirrat	Grower (Scotland)	Term expires December 2011	HGCA appointee
Andrew Manfield	Grower	Term expires December 2012	
William Bradwell	Grower	Term expires December 2013	HGCA appointee
Mark Ringrose	nabim observer		Non-voting post

**RL Barley, Oats & Other Cereals Crop Committee**

<b>Member</b>	<b>Position</b>	<b>Membership date</b>	<b>Notes</b>
Richard Jennaway	BSPB appointee	Term expires December 2012	
Lee Robinson	BSPB appointee	Term expires December 2011	
To be confirmed	MAGB appointee	Term expires December 2012	
Colin Brown	BOBMA	Term expires December 2013	
Ethel White	Variety specialist	Term expires December 2012	HGCA appointee
Adrian Newton	Pathologist	Term expires December 2012	
Eric Anderson	Agronomist	Term expires December 2011	
Adrian Fisher	Trader	Term expires December 2011	
Julian Lewis	Grower (spring oats & barley)	Term expires December 2012	
Peter Riley	Agronomist (to represent Growers interests in the East)	Term expires December 2011	
Gordon Cairns	Grower (Scotland)	Term expires December 2013	HGCA appointee
To be confirmed	Malting observer		Non-voting post
James Brosnan	Observer		Non-voting post. Usually invited to planning meeting when micro-malting tests are discussed